



Heritage Practice Amidst the Pandemic: Synthesizing the Place-making and Food Security Webinar

INTRODUCTION

This ICOMOS Philippines Webinar is one product of an earlier discussion on April 25, 2020. In that discussion, ICOMOS Philippine members met to explore the state of the heritage practice during the pandemic, and what members have been able to do - or not do - in this new environment. Several issues emerged from this discussion, some of them have successfully enabled food security while also promoting heritage.

This webinar explored this topic further with selected ICOMOS Philippine members and specialists with the aim of providing some perspectives connecting food security and cultural heritage, both tangible and intangible components.

The following ICOMOS members and specialists contributed to these discussions which formed part of the first ICOMOS Webinar Series hosted live in the ICOMOS Facebook Page last June 20, 2020:

Place-making & Food Security
Thinking of Heritage Conservation and Food Production

Discussions with

- Dr. Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita**
Professor Emeritus, Ateneo de Manila University
- Ms. Patricia Maria Santiago**
Board Member of Nayong Pilipino
- Ms. Estela Duque**
Founder of Moulinet Chocolat Ltd
- Mr. Gabriel Caballero**, Moderator
ICOMOS Philippines

ICOMOS Philippines Webinar
June 20, 2020 @ 6pm
(Manila Time)

International Council on Monuments and Sites
Conseil International des Monuments et des Sites
Komite ng Pilipinas

INTRAMUROS ADMINISTRATION

- **Dr. Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita**, Professor Emeritus from the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at the Ateneo de Manila University.
- **Ms. Patricia Maria Santiago**, part of the Sustainable Sagada initiative, an online support market for local produce of farmers from Sagada which aims to help bring local produce to reach consumers in Manila.
- **Ms. Estela Duque**, an architect, historian, social entrepreneur who founded Moulinet Chocolat Limited to introduce Philippine specialty cocoa to the global market.
- **Ms. Chen Mencias**, an environmental planner who specialises in sustainable tourism planning and natural resource management.
- **Ms. Katreen Andrea Castillo**, an agroecological farmer who works with indigenous peoples and small holder organic farmers through a Metro Manila social enterprise.
- **Mr. Gabriel Caballero**, a landscape architect and independent world heritage specialist who does sensitive landscape design interventions, and cultural landscape research in rapidly urbanizing areas in Asia.

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>



CONCEPT

In order to understand the links between food security and cultural heritage, it is essential to re-examine three key terms: food security, food sovereignty, and their relationship to cultural heritage.

Food Security and Food Sovereignty

The first term *food security* is defined as the supply, the availability, and the stability of price of basic foodstuff in the international and domestic market (World Food Conference, 1974). Over the decades, the meanings associated with food security evolved to reflect the political economy of international trade. (TP) *Food sovereignty* emerged more than three decades later, in reaction to grass roots movements around the world, and uncovered more clearly the mediators, interactions, and instruments of food production, distribution, and consumption.

Food sovereignty prioritises local and national economies and markets and empowers peasant and family farmer-driven agriculture, artisanal – fishing, pastoralist-led grazing, and food production, distribution and consumption based on environmental, social and economic sustainability. Food sovereignty promotes transparent trade that guarantees just incomes to all peoples as well as the rights of consumers to control their food and nutrition. – Nyéléni Declaration on Food Sovereignty (February 2007) at Sélingué, Mali

Food sovereignty provided a framework for distinguishing not only between human and legal agents i.e. farm owner vis-à-vis farm workers, producers and consumers vis-à-vis corporations. More importantly it recognised generational differences and our responsibility to future generations. These subsets of agents are conspicuously disconnected, and their interests often contradictory.

Cultural Heritage

The third term, cultural heritage, acknowledges the central role of change and human culture in shaping food production. Agricultural practices passed on for generations, can evolve to cater to a global market as demonstrated by the UNESCO World Heritage status of sites like the Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras, the Agave Landscape and Ancient Industrial Facilities of Tequila, the Champagne Hillsides, Houses and Cellars, and the Coffee Cultural Landscape of Colombia. These sites highlight the deep connections between food, people, places, and culture in various parts of the world.

RESPONDING TO QUERIES – PURSUING A PUBLIC DISCOURSE

The webinar of ICOMOS Philippines was seen by various members of the public from different universities (such as the Polytechnic University of the Philippines, University of the Philippines and University of Tsukuba, Japan) professional organizations (such as the Philippine Association of Landscape Architects, Philippine Institute of Environmental Planners and ICOMOS members from India and the Philippines), tourism entities (such as the Association of Tour Guides of Negros, and Banga-an Bnb and Coffee House from Sagada) and national institutions (such as the Department of Foreign Affairs, Gender and Development Office of Muntinlupa City, the National Parks Development Committee and the National

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>



Reconstruction Authority from Nepal). There were many questions received, which indicates a healthy public interest in the topic.

The webinar exposes a need for public discourse in the Philippines on the politics of food: to show how growers and culinary heritage practitioners, and everyone as consumers can support primary food producers. The example of Sagada in Northern Philippines, indicates the need for this platform in the public domain, to discuss our changing relationship with nature through food, cultural practices, and tourism.

Annex A of this report shows the responses by the webinar speakers to pertinent question raised. For this webinar, questions have been grouped into two broad themes: the first, brings globalization to bear on the Philippine context of food chain; the second focuses on local issues of food, tourism, economic development and intangible heritage.

Globalization

This theme emerged in public questions, which explores the roles of trade, transport and technology in connecting people to places. The following topics were raised: (a) certification systems ensuring the food we consume is safe to eat; (b) the complexity of the food chain, especially the role of middle men; (c) the link between food sovereignty and Geographical Indications or GIs, as seen through the tensions between *terroir* and heritage in Europe vis-à-vis the New World.

Local Issues of Food, Tourism, Economic Development and Intangible Heritage

The second theme focused on local issues like the relationship of agricultural production to tourism; the role of cooperatives in the supply chain; the importance of celebrating unique or heirloom agricultural products like Lambanog; the difference between industrialization vis-à-vis innovation; and the conservation of indigenous knowledge systems and practices (IKSP) by local government units.

In the Philippines there is also a need to formally recognize self-sufficient indigenous communities whose traditions have established long-standing connections with nature and the built environment. Indigenous experience and environmental management practices provide a rich resource for cultivation practices, land rights, soil and water conservation, and biodiversity protection.

CONCLUSIONS

ICOMOS Philippines hopes that this webinar provides new ideas that can contribute to improving the appreciation for Filipino farmers, and artisans, and improve their commercial prospects. The lack of interest and of involvement in traditional agricultural practices especially by the youth, will lead to a loss of traditional knowledge, and risks destruction of cultural landscapes that are shaped by the dying farming traditions. This holds true for fishing villages, sugar plantations, salt-making regions, and other places where food production is central to these cultural landscapes' cultural significance

Covid-19 has forced us to reconsider what is truly essential for human survival, bringing us back to the central role of food security and food sovereignty to life. This is now threatened by climate change and, in

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>



as we witness during this pandemic, globalization. Examining the relationships between food, culture, and places, enables us to comprehend the richness of the conscious and intuitive processes of place-making. The small rural communities and the agricultural landscapes are important heritage places that need stronger support from consumers, heritage stakeholders and local governments. These are essential if they are to remain in business. It is equally important that they recognize the worth of the food they produce, landscapes they tend to, and traditions they keep.

An account from the community in the province of Sagada shows revised priorities during the pandemic. Noting how the natural sites have flourished in the absence of tourists during the lockdown, the community renews its appreciation for their landscape. They say the three things that are most important to them: food security, protection of their natural resources, and expressions of their culture. The community now has a new appreciation of their traditional knowledge – with some changing their roof from galvanized iron sheets back to traditional thatch. What needs to be demonstrated is the longer impact not just on the vista, but the community's general well-being.



Photos of a Dap-ay, a traditional place of gathering in Sagada. On the left shows the removal of more modern materials of corrugated metal which was replaced by more traditional roofing materials (right) during the pandemic. Photo from Patricia Santiago.

In summary the webinar illustrates that humanity's food resources can be secured, while conserving its most important cultural heritage, based on these three basic principles:

- Respect for the environment.
- Build an equitable relationship with the primary producers of our food.
- Recognise indigenous knowledge systems and practices for the benefit of these communities.

CONTRIBUTORS

- Estela Duque, *ICOMOS Philippines Member*
- Gabriel Caballero, *ICOMOS Philippines Member / ISCCL Contributing Member*
- Maria Christina Paterno, *ICOMOS Philippines President*

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>

ANNEX A: Responses to Public Queries

| Questions | Responses |
|--|---|
| Theme 1: Globalization | |
| <p>Terroir, Geographical Indications (G.I.), Origin Labelling Do you agree that European “<i>terroir</i>” perspective vs. New World heritage perspective discussions need to include intellectual property protection for “geographical indications” of indigenous/traditional knowledge of the Philippines as the legal regime to help sustain our branding efforts on a global scale? I have yet to see any Philippine research on this subject matter. (<i>Vida Soraya Verzosa</i>)</p> | <p>Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita The concept of <i>terroir</i> is closely linked with Origin Labelling. The latter protects a specific farming spot on this globe that has traditional cultural food production practices associated with it. In effect, this blocks the tendency of capitalists to disregard biodiversity and cultural heritage in favour of cheap land and cheap labour so that they may earn easy profits.</p> <p>Estela Duque There is no wide-ranging research on the Philippine Government side, however in 2015-2017 a Filipina undertook a masters level study in Food Identity at <i>Ecole Supérieure d'Agricultures</i> (ESA) at Angers (France), analysing the development of G.I. for three different products: Guimaras mangoes, Davao cacao, Lake Sebu T'nalak. We could ask the scholarship sponsor to make this study available to the wider public.</p> |
| <p>Examples of Branding Food Bohol has started to identify and use cultural and non-cultural icons to act as brands. Say, Chocolate Hills, Tarsier, Old Stone Churches and other identified icons (<i>Blair Ligan Panong</i>)</p> <p>Branding & packaging is really a key for us doing the fine flavour cacao beans. Thanks Moulinet Chocolat & Intramuros and all persons responsible for this forum. <i>Mabuhay kayong lahat!</i> Jun here from Kablon Farm, Tupi, South Cotabato! (<i>Ernesto Pantua Jr</i>)</p> | <p>Estela Duque Yes, it's important to be aware of the role of cultural and non-cultural icons in creating a regional image. However, the most important message that we are trying to impart about the G.I. system is the creation of a quality assurance system to distinguish products closely related to <i>terroir</i> from cheap alternatives. Branding is not equivalent to the quality assurance system that will ensure sustainability, traceability, and transparency --- all of which small farmers with high value products need help with, for their efforts to remain viable.</p> |
| <p>Providing More Economic Benefits to Farmers The middlemen have always been a problem in the value chain. What do you think is the best solution to circumvent this and transfer the economic benefit to the farmers? (<i>Chen Mencias</i>)</p> | <p>Estela Duque The Philippine Government can help small scale farmers and food processors, but it must be clearly established from the beginning who the intended beneficiaries of these interventions are, and how they are held accountable. There must be a period of assessment to examine how a long supply chain has changed, so that highly exploitative practices are not hidden by intermediaries, able to corner the capital required for growing, processing, and distributing the goods and commodities.</p> <p>Patricia Maria Santiago I think one of the best solutions is for the Department of Agriculture to further provide trainings that will empower farmers not just on agricultural processes but also in business management. This way,</p> |

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address

Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address

info@icomosphilippines.com

Website

<http://philippines.icomos.org/>

| | |
|--|---|
| | <p>they will be able to sell their produce directly to consumers or buyers that will give them a fair price. Once these farmers have established their farms as a business, the LGUs can then shift their food festivals into agriculture based festivals where they can organize a buyer's fair for their produce. This will open opportunities for direct buying and will definitely be more economically beneficial to farmers.</p> <p>Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita There's a current system in Tublay, Benguet where the LGU provides training and organic inputs for farmers. They also have a delivery vehicle but they partner with the local church who have their own organic practicing flock in order to fill the trucks volume and bring produce to Metro Manila.</p> |
| <p>Produce Reaching Consumers We have enough farmers' produce to feed the people as more went back to farming with government support and farm tourism is already on full swing. The problems they are encountering is how their produce will ever arrive to consumers with public and private sector help. Farm to market platform. <i>(Ed Ibanez)</i></p> | <p>Estela Duque Yes, a logistics and distribution network that benefits more primary producers has not yet fully established. The private sector also needs to step up, because it stands to benefit from filling the gap in the market, in particular in terms of processing the produce to extend the shelf life of the agricultural products so that the food products can be distributed more widely.</p> <p>Patricia Maria Santiago Logistics and distribution has always been a challenge for most farmers. The LGU through their Municipal Agriculture Office should be able to provide solutions for transportation of produce and linkages with potential buyers. I think these are the bigger and more important tasks of the LGUs.</p> |
| <p>Quality Assurance and Issues of Farmers Wages Certification and labelling does not always guarantee a mark. Even with certification, farmers are not always guaranteed a living wage. <i>(Ronald Lagazo)</i></p> | <p>Estela Duque The issue of earning a living through farming is not tied to certification but access to the market. If the farmer has only one means available of disposing of his/her produce, then the distributor(s) can dictate produce or commodity price and terms. It is important for farmers not only to have several channels for distribution, more importantly the farmers' capability to add value to the produce will provide a more stable and regular income outside of the seasonal planting and harvesting cycle.</p> <p>Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita While <i>terroir</i> and Origin Labelling may not automatically guarantee the farmer either a decent wage or decent profit, it at least gives him a chance to compete in the highly competitive global market. It protects his product's label from being used by others with lower labour costs. Filipinos invented "nata de coco" and were the sole exporters to Japan before. But we did not protect the brand name. Now Malaysians, Vietnamese, Thais are outselling us in the Japanese market thanks to a variety of factors.</p> |

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Modernizing Agricultural Practices How do you balance between preserving indigenous agricultural practices and modernizing the food production system? Innovative agriculture is key to food security & fair trade for farmers. <i>(Bianca Arco)</i></p> | <p>Estela Duque Modernization is often equated to industrialised production, and this cannot be the case for heritage produce and indigenous or artisanal products. The key to improving the economic return for these agricultural and cultural products is understanding who it is that modernization is supposed to help: the growers, processors, artisans, traditional landowners OR further down the supply chain like the logistics providers, market/venue operators, or some of the middle men like large cooperatives, bank lenders and fund managers? If the answer is to make the returns more sustainable for the producers and makers, then the answer is through equitable distribution of profit and a recognition of their special or unique contexts. The latter is what Geographic Indication (G.I.) certification is for.</p> <p>Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita I do not think that Origin Labelling block innovation and research. Even as Europeans protect their artisanal procedures in specific foods, they do use up to date scientific research to understand their environment much better. E.g. They are very aware that global warming will alter a specific <i>terroir</i> resulting in unrecognizable products. This is also about thinking ahead.</p> |
| <p>Food Heritage Celebrations I would like to hear more about local food security and food heritage celebration within the community and not for tourism or outside markets. Have there been examples of these where LGU and respective department links have carried out successful projects? <i>(Katreen Andrea Castillo)</i></p> | <p>Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita The President signed EO Proclamation 469 in 2018 declaring April as the Filipino Food Month. I am still hoping that this will provide an opportunity for local communities to create and organize their own agriculture-based food festivals, not for tourism but for appreciation of one's agricultural resources and directly marketing it to buyers. The appreciation and celebration has to start from the ground, from the community then allow it to grow bigger to be part of a national food festival.</p> <p>Estela Duque There are food heritage events like Philippine Harvest by Department of Agriculture & Stores Specialists, Inc. at Central Square BGC, which happens monthly while the Manila Coffee Festival by Coffee Heritage Project; Intramuros Chocolate Festival with Intramuros Administration happen annually.</p> |

| <p>Theme 2: Local Issues of Food, Tourism, Economic Development and Intangible Heritage</p> | |
|---|--|
| <p>LGU's Role in Tourism and Food Security Have there been any LGU projects/mandates that now ensures that resources are not given solely to heritage tourism but also for local food security? Stories of water scarcity for farms and food production as tourism has been the priority. <i>(Katreen Andrea Castillo)</i></p> | <p>Patricia Maria Santiago I can speak for Sagada's case. The Sangguniang Bayan is currently trying to pass an ordinance that will protect their natural heritage sites which includes their forests and falls. This ensures that the source of water that provides irrigation to their terraces will be protected.</p> |

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>Agriculture vs Tourism as Economic Drivers Do you think that it is impossible to balance agriculture and tourism as economic drivers of development for rural communities? Or is it a choice between the two? (<i>Chen Mencias</i>)</p> | <p>Estela Duque In theory, agricultural prosperity and farm tourism could go hand in hand to drive rural progress. However, for this to happen, a lot of planning and policy support is required at national, regional, and municipality levels. Regional contexts require regional approaches.</p> <p>For example, the agricultural productivity of South Cotabato especially in terms of specialty cacao is a magnet for international tourism but the peace and order situation is always a hindrance for overseas guests because foreign governments cannot assure their citizens of safety. If the most innovative cacao farmers and/or farm cooperatives are to benefit from farm tourism, they need some form of security that only local government can provide for their guests. Otherwise this is like an invitation for private armies to coalesce and profit from such activities.</p> |
| <p>Tourism and it's Effects to Local Food Prices In the case of the Cordillera, food and cost of living has actually increased so much for local communities due to this heritage tourism - usually since the food that's normally consumed is reserved for the tourists and outside buyers where even water is prioritised more for tourism than food production. (<i>Katreen Andrea Castillo</i>)</p> | <p>Patricia Maria Santiago This was the case of Sagada at the height of mass tourism or pre-COVID time. The source of water from the mountains were diverted to hostels and restaurants that accommodate tourists. This depleted the needed water not just for local households but for the farms and terraces as well. This is a very common tourism trap that's so misplaced. I think this is the perfect time for communities to think about sustainability and what this means to every family that lives in the town.</p> |
| <p>Cultural Understanding of Food Thank you Dr.Zialcita for talking about our Lambanog. Proud Quezonian here.Lambanog <i>terroir</i>...showcase of our natural assure the pristine waters of Mt Banahaw which waters our coconut plantations and our culture of Tagay...the Awitan at Sayaw! (<i>Kulinarya Tagala</i>)</p> | <p>Fernando Nakpil-Zialcita Thank you. Do Tayabenyos study enough how Lambanog is made? I previously went to Tayabas in two separate trips and both times, the tour guides declared that "<i>Lambanog is coconut mixed with alcohol.</i>" This is not the case.</p> <p>It is important that our primary and elementary education ground us in local geography, history, culture and heritage. Our educational system should emphasize love of country. Students must know first their locality through tours and visits. At middle levels, they are introduced to the region. Only at a higher level, is the national fully discussed. The progression is from the concrete and familiar to the abstract. In our field schools held every year at a community outside Metro Manila, we discovered that textbooks hardly say anything about local heritage. At Puerto Princesa, high schoolers read about the Ifugao rice terraces but not about the cultural and natural landscapes of Palawan. In discussing indigenous peoples, they read about Luzon Negritos, but not about the Batak, Tagbanua. Many of our countrymen/ women are disconnected from their heritage whether local or national.</p> |
| <p>LGU's Capacity to Document Intangible Heritage Intangible heritage is difficult to document but so easy to lose. Are LGUs in the Philippines capacitated enough to document their own intangible heritage before the are</p> | <p>Patricia Maria Santiago The challenge with LGUs is that they are only there for a limited term with their own priorities and agendas. Even if they can document their own intangible heritage now, the next leaders may see this as backward and will opt to prioritize modern practices to replace the traditional. The best way is to empower indigenous communities and</p> |

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
http://philippines.icomos.org/

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>replaced with modernity? (<i>Chen Mencias</i>)</p> | <p>their leaders to do the documentation and find ways to pass this on to the younger generation.</p> |
| <p>Young People and Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Practices (IKSP) How can IKSP be preserved when many of the young generations do not want to farm anymore, and other higher paying options are available? (<i>Chen Mencias</i>)</p> | <p>Patricia Maria Santiago The IKSP must be taught to everyone to see this process to have higher value. When this is considered to have higher value to the market then locals can earn more. Hopefully, they will realize that higher volume does not necessarily mean higher yield.</p> |
| <p>Young People and Farming In most rural areas in the country, the younger generation is no longer interested in farming. In some places the lockdown has pushed some communities to explore farming again as a more sustainable food source. This is because distribution of processed food has been disrupted. This renewed interest may be good, but do you think that this can be sustained even after Covid. The concern is that this may be temporary, Filipinos being <i>ningas kugon</i> and having the tendency to choose convenience over sustainability. (<i>Chen Mencias</i>)</p> | <p>Patricia Maria Santiago I do not think this pandemic will be over very soon even if we all hope that it ends tomorrow. Classes are disrupted, the choice of leaving to be an OFW is no longer there, there is a looming recession and the only safe place to be now is in the rural areas where there are vast lands to do farming. Urban dwellers do not have that luxury. Farming now has become a luxury and a dream for a lot of Filipinos. If the government can create a plan during this time of the pandemic that will support farmers to earn more, i think the youth will be enticed to stay and do farming. They need to see the bigger and better picture of farming and not the picture that leaves them with no other choice.</p> |
| <p>Future of Sagada after Covid-19 Do you think Sagada will now be more cautious when they re-open for tourism? Have they decided to focus merely on agriculture or are they still considering tourism? (<i>Chen Mencias</i>)</p> | <p>Patricia Maria Santiago Sagada is more cautious in re-opening their tourism. They realize that it is more important to ensure the community's safety. They are looking at farm tourism as a new product when they open again. Definitely, they will have an imposed carrying capacity for their sites. Sites will even have to be identified. The caves may no longer be suitable for tourism.</p> |

ICOMOS Philippines

Office Address
Rm. 300A First United Building
413 Escolta St. Manila City

Email Address
info@icomosphilippines.com

Website
<http://philippines.icomos.org/>